

### Summary of the responses received and appraisal of views expressed

1. The points of view received as part of the consultation are set out in *italics* below and have been grouped according to the points raised where appropriate.
2. The Council's response to each point can be seen underneath, under the heading "Appraisal of views expressed."

### Local Member response

3. Cllr Stubbs submitted a response which included the following points: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7)
  - *The current Willows High School building is not fit for purpose, it has already had to close once because the electrics failed. I want the new building and significantly upgraded facilities to be open to the community outside of school hours.*
  - *I support the idea of a full partnership with St Albans RFC and that they have a firm agreement to have full access to the same number of pitches they have now, outside of school hours.*
  - *I support the proposal to establish to establish Post-16 provision at Willows High School as this would mean that the provision available in the area matches the provision available elsewhere.*
  - *Retaining a Catholic primary school is important to the community. This choice should not be moved against the wishes of parents, the alternative school is too far away. I have told the archdiocese that they should reverse the decision to close.*
  - *I support the proposal to expand and move Baden Powell Primary School. The school deserves a new building with significantly improved facilities.*
  - *I support the proposal to remove nursery provision from Baden Powell Primary School as long as no places were lost and the alternative provision was superior and in the same area.*

### Appraisal of views expressed

## **Response to views expressed**

4. The proposed changes were developed as part of the Council's commitment to making changes in Adamsdown and Splott in line with its vision to deliver inspiring, sustainable, community focused schools that transform opportunities.
5. As part of this, the Catholic Archdiocese requested the proposal to close St Alban's RC Primary School be included in wider proposals for the area.
6. The Archdiocese's reasons for proposing the closure of St Alban's RC Primary School were based upon the low numbers of Catholic families' pupils choosing to attend the school, together with long standing issues regarding recruiting and retaining a permanent Headteacher to lead the school.
7. Information regarding the number of children recorded as being Catholic is supplied by the school to the Catholic Education Service (CES) as part of its annual census. This information is collated and supplied to respective Archdioceses to support planning and support for schools.
8. In response to the consultation, a number of stakeholders suggested that the number of Catholic children at the school stated in documents was incorrect. The school census information provided by St Alban's RC Primary School to the CES was reviewed during the consultation period, and verification of the revised information supplied by the school was undertaken by the Archdiocese. This identified a higher percentage of Catholic children attending the school than previously reported.
9. Concerns were also raised during the consultation around the perceived failure of the Archdiocese, the Local Authority and the Central South Consortium to ensure appropriate leadership arrangements for the school.
10. The Catholic Archdiocese has subsequently reiterated that the primary reason for requesting the closure of St Alban's was the rapidly falling number of Catholics in the school, as had been reported by the school in successive Census returns to the Catholic Education Service. As the Census figures reported had been erroneous, and the actual figure of Catholic pupils was similar to that of several other Catholic schools in Cardiff, the main imperative for closure is no longer valid.
11. The Catholic Archdiocese is also assured that, if the school were to remain open and the Headship advertised on a permanent basis, a credible candidate has expressed an interest in the role.

12. In light of these developments the Archdiocese has requested that the closure of St Alban's Catholic Primary School, is not progressed.
13. If the Council does not progress the proposal to close St Alban's Catholic Primary School, it would no longer be appropriate to expand Baden Powell Primary School from two forms of entry to three forms of entry. The proposed expansion of Tremorfa Nursery School, utilising the St Alban's buildings that would have been vacated, is no longer feasible.
14. Taking the above information into account, it is recommended that the proposals are not progressed.
15. The need to invest in school accommodation in the area is acknowledged. As well as having the right number of school places, the Council must ensure that school facilities are fit for purpose. New school buildings can play a key role not only as places to inspire and educate children, but also as a vibrant and dynamic learning centres in which all ages are able to learn and grow that are not used only by pupils but by families and the wider community.
16. It is therefore proposed that further work is undertaken to develop modified proposals for consideration by Cabinet in early 20120. The points raised during the consultation will be further appraised prior to bringing forward revised proposals for early years, primary and secondary school provision to serve Adamsdown and Splott.

## **Estyn**

17. A response from Estyn included the following points: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7)
  - *The proposer has provided a clear rationale for the reasons behind this proposal. It lists the possible advantages, disadvantages and risks appropriately. The proposer outlines the potential benefits of the proposal clearly. The proposer lists potential disadvantages and risks appropriately. It acknowledges fairly that the proposal to close St Alban's Catholic Primary School would lead to fewer Catholic schools and reduce such places available in Cardiff overall.*
  - *Pupils wishing to access a faith based education in Cardiff may need to travel further to school. However, the proposer notes that the Diocese has requested the closure due to the low number of Catholic pupils choosing to attend the school and long standing recruitment issues. The proposer lists the potential risks usefully. These include the risk that the projected increase in the number of pupils does not happen. It notes fairly that this is unlikely based on the number of pupils in primary schools in Cardiff and proposed new housing developments.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

18. The Council acknowledges the conclusions of Estyn on the overall merits of the proposals.

### **Willows High School Governing Body**

19. A response from Willows High School Governing Body included the following points: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7)
- *We support the building of the new school. The current building is at the end of its functional life. We note that the building has already effectively failed once when the school had to be shut for over a month because of electrical problems.*
  - *We are extremely proud of the journey the school has been on over the last period but believe for the teachers and pupils to take the next step, we need a new building. We want the building to be transformative to outcomes at the school as well as for the wider community.*
  - *We would want to work with community partners to ensure that the community feels the full benefit of this facility. We believe the new school should play a part in addressing wider issues in the community including issues of anti-social behaviour.*
  - *We understand that there will always be concerns about a change in location and would want to be involved in ensuring the park on the current school site is the best it can be.*
  - *We support the proposal for post sixteen education, as it would mean that children in Splott, Tremorfa and Adamsdown have the same access as young people across the city.*
  - *We fully expect the design of the building to be sympathetic with its surroundings and to represent the vision of the schools leadership team, we expect to be involved right through any process.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

20. The Council acknowledges the views of the Willows High School Governing Body.
21. Issues related to the expansion and transfer of the school are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.

## **Willows High School Headteacher**

22. A response from the Headteacher of Willows High School included the following: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7):
- *The current Willows High School building is not currently fit for purpose. We are fighting a losing battle in keeping the site water tight and heated, taking a considerable amount of our budget in maintaining the site as opposed to providing additional learning opportunities and experiences for our pupils.*
  - *I feel that our catchment would benefit from having onsite Post-16 provision. This would provide the pupils of Willows High School with equitable provision when compared with other schools across the city. It would also help reduce the number of pupils who are NEET at the end of Key Stage 4.*
  - *Historically, our students do not tend to travel well and would have built strong relationships with the staff at Willows, so having a selection of Post 16, A Level and vocational courses available on site would be of great benefit.*
  - *Depending on the finishing times of the primary school, it would be useful to have a free after school club so that working parents who have given secondary pupils the responsibility of collecting their younger siblings aren't disadvantaged.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

23. The Council acknowledges the views of the Headteacher of Willows High School.
24. Issues related to the expansion and transfer of the school are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.

## **St Albans Catholic Primary School Governing Body**

25. A response from the St Albans RC Primary School Governing Body included the following: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7):
- *The Governing Body of St Alban's Catholic Primary School support the proposed investment in educational facilities within the Splott and Tremorfa areas. However, we firmly believe that St Alban's should remain open as a 1FE school and be included as part of the proposal in terms of investment, refurbishment or having new build accommodation.*
  - *Having considered in detail the proposals made by the Council we object to the justification given for the proposed closure of St Alban's for the following reasons.*

- *There has been no significant fall of pupils on roll prior to the announcement of the proposed closure.*
- *The number of Catholic children attending St Alban's has been understated for some years.*
- *A Governing Body proposal to advertise for a Head in April 2018 was prevented by representatives from the Central South Consortium.*
- *The nearest alternative Catholic schools are too far for many families within the community who do not have access to personal transport.*
- *St Peter's Primary School is the closest Catholic Primary School, but according to the latest NOR data on the Council's website would not have sufficient places in all year groups for all Catholic families currently enrolled at St Alban's.*
- *St Peter's are currently in special measures following their latest Estyn inspection, and may not be the school that families wish to send their child to should St Alban's close.*
- *The disruption to the education of children in all year groups as a result of these proposals cannot be underestimated.*
- *The removal of a Catholic primary school would lead to the further diminution of the faith in this part of the city.*
- *As part of the wider proposals the community would lose access to a large part of Tremorfa Park.*
- *The school has a history of working with vulnerable groups. The move to another school can be a very traumatic experience for children, which may impact on their learning for many years to come.*

26. The Governing Body put forward a number of alternative proposals for consideration by the Council and Archdiocese, all of which include St Alban's Catholic Primary School remaining open:

- *Extending age range of St Alban's from 4-11 to 3-11, with amalgamation of the current Tremorfa Nursery School site into the school. Retaining St Alban's at 1FE and the replacement Baden Powell at 2FE.*
- *Relocate St Alban's to a vacated and refurbished Baden Powell Primary site, remaining at 1FE. Baden Powell in new build accommodation at 2FE.*
- *Refurbishment of St Alban's on our current site. New build Baden Powell Primary School at 2FE.*

27. The Governing Body also asked the following question:

- *The consultation suggests that the existing Willows site is unsuitable for building due to it being a flood plain and would be converted to open space. Would there be any investment in flood defences of this site to ensure that it remains usable in periods of heavy rainfall?*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

28. The Council acknowledges the views of St Albans RC Primary School Governing Body.
29. Issues related to the proposed closure of the school are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.
30. The alternative proposals put forward are noted and will be further appraised prior to bringing forward revised proposals for early years, primary and secondary school provision to serve Adamsdown and Splott.
31. The Willows High School site is within the flood zone and is therefore not viable to be developed for a school at this time. It is anticipated that, following construction of the proposed new coastal defence wall, surveys would be commissioned for the flood boundary to be reassessed by Natural Resources Wales.

### **St Alban's Primary School Interim Headteacher**

32. A response from the Interim Headteacher of St Alban's Primary School included the following: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7):
  - *The children who live in the catchment area for St Alban's Catholic Primary School deserve an outstanding education – and with the right investment and visionary leadership, this could be accomplished at St Alban's within three years.*
  - *The impact on many of the poorest families in Cardiff – making education so inaccessible to many.*
  - *Maintaining good attendance at school will be difficult for many children.*
  - *The proposal is in direct conflict with the Closing the Gap priority the LA and Welsh Government has.*
  - *Discrimination against Catholic families. The right to choose your own religion and beliefs in Article 14 of the UNRC is for all children, including children living in Tremorfa.*
  - *Having audited the current number of Catholic pupils and those preparing for the sacrament of Baptism, the school records now indicate that over 36% of pupils are baptised Catholics, with a further 11% of pupils preparing to receive the Sacrament of Baptism on November 15<sup>th</sup> 2019.*
  - *A closure of St Alban's Catholic Primary School would be short-sighted in that it would leave Tremorfa Catholic families short of places for primary*

*school pupils and will be detrimental to the education to many vulnerable pupils.*

- *There are many other alternatives and options which are plausible and need to be considered – options which can provide the education and learning environment all children in Cardiff serve, in a location which is accessible to the community, and which is non-discriminatory.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

33. The Council acknowledges the view of the St Alban's Catholic Primary School Interim Headteacher.
34. Issues related to the proposed closure of the school are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.

### **St Alban's Catholic Primary School Staff**

35. A response from the staff of St Alban's Primary School included the following: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7):
  - *We support the investment of educational facilities within Splott and Tremorfa, which includes the re-development of Willows High School, Baden Powell Primary School and an Early Years provision for the area. However, we would like to voice our objections to the closure of St. Alban's.*
  - *The educational standards of our pupils will be jeopardised if their educational journey is interrupted.*
  - *The attendance of a large group of pupils will be threatened if they were to move to a school further away.*
  - *The nearest alternative Catholic schools are too far for our pupils to walk;*
  - *St Alban's pupil attainments continue to rise despite a deficit budget for over seven years.*
  - *Without the school, the community will lose its heart and the moral guidance which is so needed in this modern age of social media coupled with a rise in serious crime.*
  - *Many staff have dedicated their careers to working and serving St. Alban's Catholic Primary and we are concerned that the same loyalty will not be shown to the staff by the Archdiocese if they are to be made unemployed.*

- *We would like to raise the issue that when the proposal was first drafted some of the information was inaccurate. This information included:*
  - *Governors had failed to secure a substantive head teacher when in fact they met in summer 2018 with a proposed advert which was then withheld by the Central South Consortium and the Archdiocese.*
  - *Previous to this, consecutive non-Catholic head teachers were recruited and therefore were never in contention to become a permanent head teacher.*
  - *A proven successful Catholic head made an offer three years ago to Anne Robertson to lead St. Alban's instead of another non-Catholic head that had been seconded; Mrs Robertson failed to return the call.*

36. The staff put forward a number of alternative options for consideration:

- *St. Alban's is relocated to the Baden Powell site. This would allow us to create a nursery, family engagement, intervention and pastoral rooms, and offer nurturing provisions for Catholics in the Cardiff area as there is currently no provision.*
- *We remain on the current site and we take over Tremorfa Nursery creating a St. Alban's nursery offering a 3-11 Catholic education on one site. Tremorfa Nursery can then be relocated to the new Baden Powell site.*
- *St. Alban's remains on its current site with improved facilities and the Early Years Centre, as well as Tremorfa Nursery occupy Baden Powell's current site also with improved facilities.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

37. The Council acknowledges the view of the St Alban's Catholic Primary School staff.
38. Issues related to the proposed closure of the school are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.
39. The alternative proposals put forward are noted and will be further appraised prior to bringing forward revised proposals for early years, primary and secondary school provision to serve Adamsdown and Splott.

### **Baden Powell Primary School Governing Body**

40. A response from Baden Powell Primary School Governing Body included the following: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7):
- *We support the proposal to expand and move Willows High School because of the condition of the school requires a new building and the proposed new school will bring benefits to the wider community.*

- *We support the proposal to establish Post-16 provision as it would bring greater opportunities to the pupils within their community rather than attend other establishments. However, we are mindful that the pupils may still choose to attend other education providers which adds risk to the proposals and funding issues.*
- *We support the diocese recommendation concerning faith education within this community and whatever is best for the pupil's education and welfare.*
- *We support the proposal to expand and move Baden Powell Primary School because of the deteriorating condition of the existing school and a new build being the best option in terms of cost and also the provision of up to date facilities.*
- *We recognise there will be challenges with the transition years before the new building is completed. There will need to be flexibility on budgets during this transition period and when the new school opens, taking recognition of the risk factors that have been acknowledged by the local authority such as student numbers not being as expected, and transitional financial pressures as have been experienced at other schools, such as Cardiff West. This could include, for example, parents of pupils from St Albans not sending their children to Baden Powell but to other faith schools and parents in Splott opting to send their children to other schools.*
- *We do not support the proposal to remove nursery provision from Baden Powell Primary School. We believe an ideal model would be for nursery provision to continue at Baden Powell. This would make the children's transition to primary school easier. It would also be better for parents with children at both nursery and primary school as they would not have to drop off and collect children from different sites.*
- *We support the proposal to increase the number of nursery places at Tremorfa Nursery School if it does expand the range of services while maintaining the nursery's high standards. However, our ideal model would be for continued nursery provision at Baden Powell to benefit the children's transition to primary school and for parents ease in dropping off and collecting children.*
- *We are concerned with the proposed sharing of a building, under one roof. We are concerned that the facilities and entrances are not sufficiently separate and would prefer a separate building with no accesses between the primary school and the high school. This is all the more important if the school is to be opened up to the wider community, which we would support.*
- *Baden Powell would need to retain totally separate financial control, including estate arrangement, service bills (electricity etc.).*

- *We would also wish to see better provision for Baden Powell play areas as we are always concerned for the children's safety. This would need to be in addition to any shared spaces.*
- *Although we understand the local authority supports children not being driven and picked up from school, we recognise parents will continue to do so. We would propose a dedicated drop off and pick up point within the schools site. This exists at other schools in Cardiff.*
- *We wish to ensure the identity of Baden Powell Primary School. We would want the school to retain its independent identity because we would not wish to see the school as automatically sending its pupils to Willows.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

41. The Council acknowledges the views of Baden Powell Primary School Governing Body.
42. Issues related to the proposals consulted on are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.

### **Baden Powell Primary School Acting Headteacher**

43. A response from the Headteacher of Baden Powell Primary School included the following: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7):
  - *I support the proposal to expand and move Willows High School. Willows is rated as D for condition and in need of replacing/upgrading. Deemed 'at risk' of flooding the current site appears to be unsuitable for development. The move would provide additional community facilities which would benefit the local area.*
  - *I support the proposal to establish Post-16 provision. Young people in the area currently have to seek alternative facilities and travel if they wish to continue in education post 16. Willows is the only high school in Cardiff not to offer post 16 provision which is detrimental to the school and its pupils.*
  - *I support the proposal to close St Albans Primary School if the demographic Catholic figures of 17% are accurate. I can understand the proposal by the church to close St Albans and relocate to neighbouring schools. With education budgets strained and the additional difficulties that have arisen in the school, I understand the need to provide stability for the pupils, staff and wider community.*
  - *I support the proposal to expand and move Baden Powell Primary School. I deal daily with the problems with the oil heating system, deterioration of*

*the main building and water ingress despite significant efforts in recent years to upgrade the learning environment.*

- Working in an area with high levels of deprivation and need I have concerns that a larger school may mean an increase in pupils with challenging behaviours.*
- The proposed school site would need to be securely managed given that it could potentially be shared with post 16 students, sports teams and St Albans Sports and Social Club.*
- I do have concerns at the proposed transition period where Baden Powell could potentially operate over two sites, and seek reassurance that this would be fully supported to be a success in terms of leadership and staff/pupil/family wellbeing.*
- I don't support the proposal to remove nursery provision from Baden Powell Primary School. I would be very disappointed to lose the nursery provision that is currently available as a 3-11 primary school. Transition is currently good with nursery pupils fully involved in the wider school activities and events. I do have concerns for parents and carers and the challenge of getting between different sites to drop off and collect young children while managing lateness and attendance especially in poor weather conditions.*
- I would support the expansion of places and services at Tremorfa Nursery School. I recognise that the expansion of services available to the local community would be of benefit to many of Baden Powell's families in helping them lead happy, healthy, fulfilled lives.*
- I share concerns with staff around sharing a site with a secondary school and our children mixing closely with the local teenagers and post 16 students. Although there may be positive role models, inappropriate language can be an issue and antisocial behaviour is often displayed at the neighbouring Hub.*
- It is important to retain the school's identity and not be seen as part of Willows High School.*

#### **Appraisal of views expressed**

44. The Council acknowledges the views of Baden Powell Primary School Governing Body.
45. Issues related to the proposals consulted on are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.

## Tremorfa Nursery School Governing Body

46. A response from the Governing Body of Tremorfa Nursery School included the following: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7):

- *We support the proposal to further expand the offer of early year's provision and care to children and families by developing the school as an integrated children's centre.*
- *Within the proposal there are a few concerns and considerations we wish to raise.*
- *The building is not currently compliant with the DDA. This will need to be resolved in order to ensure the centre can be fully inclusive to all. The entrance is currently too narrow for an adult wheelchair or a double pushchair.*
- *Integrating the current St Alban's building (as proposed) with Tremorfa Nursery means that children will likely need to move around the full site more during the day; practicalities of this in terms of staffing ratios and scheduling of the day will need to be considered and likely have a budget impact. The centre would likely need a supported budget over and above the regular school budget, in order to secure and maintain quality provision for education, childcare and family support.*
- *Any change of physical layout or organisation of the two buildings should not interrupt or spoil the excellent and well maintained outdoor provision on the nursery schools site, including the forest school area used regularly by parents, children and families.*
- *It must be acknowledged that the current quality of provision (resulting in a very recent excellent inspection) is very much down to the highly qualified and experienced staff at the school and the culture and ethos that the team has created and developed over the years.*
- *It is clear that the desire is to build on the excellent provision of the nursery school and build on the excellent provision of the nursery school and develop this into a centre that can provide further and enhanced excellent early years services.*
- *To ensure that this high quality provision and practice is continued and built upon we feel it is absolutely essential that the terms and conditions of the current staff are protected in order to ensure continued service.*
- *A major concern – the document states that following the closure of St Albans in July 2021, Baden Powell will operate across both sites from September 2021 until the new school is complete in 2023. Bearing in mind the capacity of Baden Powell will be increasing by 1 class per year group this raises some questions around how Tremorfa may operate expanded*

*services from August 2021 as well as providing more nursery places. This increase in capacity and services may not be possible if St Albans site is still in use by Baden Powell.*

- Both buildings require some work. The nursery building requires a suitable office space and entrance space, preferably a reception area at the entrance for health and safety reasons. St Albans will need to be re-purposed to meet CIW regulations and a certain investment would need to be made in equipment appropriate for the age of the children using the building.*
- The site should be considered for the integration of adult learning with a crèche facility for the benefit of the community.*
- Consideration should be given to using the site as a base for Flying Start health visitors which would then fully integrate services for families of children under five.*
- It is vital that the new primary school is in pram pushing distance to the nursery school to ensure the highest levels of attendance and to avoid families arriving late.*
- The long term sustainability will require a stable budget. As governors we would like to see a financial forecast in order to ensure sustainability and development of further surfaces.*

#### **Appraisal of views expressed**

47. The Council acknowledges the views of Tremorfa Nursery School Governing Body.
48. Issues related to the proposals consulted on are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.

#### **Tremorfa Nursery School Staff**

49. A response from the staff of Tremorfa Nursery School included the same points as listed above by the Governing Body. (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7):
  - As staff of Tremorfa Nursery School, we support the proposal to further expand the offer of early years provision and care to children and families by developing the school as an integrated children's centre.*

#### **Appraisal of views expressed**

50. The Council acknowledges the views of the staff of Tremorfa Nursery School.
51. Issues related to the proposals consulted on are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.

### **Moorland Primary School Headteacher**

52. A response from the Headteacher of Moorland Primary School included the following: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7):
- *I do not support the proposal to expand Willows High School. Move/New build is good. Expand is a concern with regard to the challenging nature of catchment.*
  - *I support the proposal to move Baden Powell Primary School, but not to expand. 3-form primary schools are too big in economically challenged areas. Relationships are key and the personal touch is lost once schools get too big.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

53. The Council acknowledges the views of the Headteacher of Moorland Primary School.
54. Issues related to the proposals consulted on are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.

### **Tredegarville Primary School Headteacher**

55. A response from the Headteacher of Tredegarville Primary School included the following: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7):
- *I welcome many of the changes proposed in the Willows catchment. There is clearly a need for new school buildings in this area. I also welcome the development of Tremorfa Nursery School.*
  - *My only concern with the proposals is that I feel that effectively amalgamating two separate schools and creating a very large primary school is inappropriate. I feel that a three-form entry primary in this area of considerable challenge is a mistake.*
  - *Primary schools in our cluster are already dealing with very significant challenges on a daily basis whilst serving complex communities.*
  - *Given the staffing structures of primary schools they often do not have the personnel or resources to be continually firefighting the increased number of issues that will inevitably come with increased numbers of pupils and families.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

56. The Council acknowledges the views of the Headteacher of Tredegarville Primary School.
57. Issues related to the proposals consulted on are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.

### **Save St Alban's School Committee**

58. A response from the Save St Alban's School Committee included the following: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7):
  - *The initial Equality Impact Assessment carried out should have recognised that children attending St Albans Catholic School would be affected by the proposal as the opportunity to receive a Catholic education locally would be removed. If moving to another school is considered a mitigating action then this proposal must provide Catholic education for all existing pupils but there is no guarantee of this.*
  - *Over a hundred children from St Albans have been allowed to take up places at St Peter's School which lies within the catchment area of Corpus Christi High School. If the catchment process was precisely applied St Albans School would be over subscribed.*
  - *The number of catholic children at the school was misrepresented and was based on information which was not verified by the Authorities.*
  - *There have been issues over almost a ten year period in appointing a leader on a permanent and long term contract. The current temporary head, has been doing an excellent job and did offer to take up the role on a permanent basis but not receive an acknowledgement to the offer from the Archdiocese.*
  - *The Archdiocese has been asked on a number of occasions to provide comparative number of Catholic students in local Catholic school however we do not believe the data exists.*
  - *The nearest Catholic school is St Peters Roath which has been declared in special measures. Other Catholic schools in the immediate area do not have the capacity to accommodate children from St Albans.*
  - *Children as young as 5 would be expected to cross major travel routes across the City to attend one of the schools on offer. Additionally, if there are additional travel costs to St Peters parents in one of the poorest wards in the City will have to bear the cost.*
  - *Closing the school would destroy any local support mechanisms which allow children to attend schools.*
  - *Losing the youth of the parish would have a devastating effect on the life of the children and the parish.*

- *Closing the school would deprive vulnerable children in the south of the ward of ready access to a breakfast club, destroy other voluntary initiatives and disrupt irretrievably additional learning programmes.*
- *The Catholic Church professes to be ecumenical in its outlook, but other faiths and their aspirations for education in a Catholic school are completely disregarded by this proposal.*
- *The introduction on the Oratory to the parish has been an invigorating experience for everyone, particularly for children at the school. There are many project underway which will surely place St Albans as one of the leaders of Catholic life in the Archdiocese.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

59. The Council acknowledges the view of the Save St Alban's School Committee.
60. Issues related to the proposed closure of the school are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.

### **St Alban's Parish Council**

61. A response from the Chair of the St Albans Parish Council included the following: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7):
- *St Alban's School is in one of the most deprived areas of Cardiff and is and has been an important factor in the community life of Splott and Tremorfa.*
  - *Should the school close it will be difficult for the parents to give their children a Catholic education, as distance, expenses and no guarantee of a place at the nearest Catholic school.*
  - *Should St Albans stay open, the extension of Baden Powell would not be required on the forecast of future pupil numbers. If St Albans closes I feel that the extension should take place.*
  - *Breakfast clubs should be provided as the area is very deprived and all investigations have proved that the children's education is vastly improved as a result.*
  - *As Chair of the Parish Council I have been approached by many of our Parishioners expressing dismay at the thought of losing our school.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

62. The Council acknowledges the views of St Alban's Parish Council.

63. Issues related to the proposals consulted on are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.

### **St Albans RFC**

64. A response from the St Albans RFC included the following: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7):
- *St Alban's Rugby Football Sports and Social Club has an acute interest in Cardiff Council plans to re-develop Tremorfa Park; as the Community Clubhouse is located on the land and both the Rugby and Football sections operate out of the Club, on the pitches and surrounding land.*
  - *Our main concern is the likely logistical impact of the planned changes on present playing and supporter areas. Will there be the same area for playing and will there be any disruption to fixtures and training?*
  - *Although the RFC has rights to existing pitches, we need to understand the rights to facilities in the future.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

65. The Council acknowledges the views of the St Alban's Rugby Football Sports and Social Club.
66. Issues related to the proposals consulted on are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.
67. Officers will continue to work with the Club around revised proposals for early years, primary and secondary school provision to serve Adamsdown and Splott.

### **Future Generations Commissioner for Wales**

68. A response from the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales included the following: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7):
- *The frameworks set up prompts to guide public bodies in formulating policies and developing projects, but also to scrutinize such decisions or policies.*
  - *It is important that well-being objectives (of both public bodies and public service boards), the well-being assessments and plans, the statutory goals and the sustainable development principle (including the 5 ways of working) are considered throughout the process.*
  - *The Future Generations Commissioner for Wales is currently developing a new framework for public buildings in collaboration with 21<sup>st</sup> Century Schools, to ensure that the Act is properly applied and that public buildings are fit for purpose.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

69. The Council acknowledges the views expressed by the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales.

### **The Parish Priest of St Alban's Church**

70. A response from the Parish Priest of St Alban's Church included the following: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 7):
- *The closing of St Albans's School infringes the rights of Catholic children to access a Catholic school in a reasonable manner. The Welsh Government has promised that Faith as a protected characteristic is the goal. This Parish is in a poor, deprived area.*
  - *I support the Parish of St Albans to develop the Parish school by reviewing the school in 2 years. Withdraw the proposal of closure from the present process.*
  - *St Albans school already provides clubs for the children. This Catholic School provides a family and nurturing community for all its pupils, whether Catholic, Protestant or Muslim.*
  - *The recent history of the school reflects the failure of the statutory institutions of Church and Council. The children are the ones who have suffered. Closure is not the answer.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

71. The Council acknowledges the views of the Parish Priest of St Alban's Church.
72. Issues related to the proposed closure of the school are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.

### **Willows High School Pupil representation**

73. Officers met with members of the Willows High School, School Council to discuss the proposals and gather their opinions.
74. The points raised by the pupils included
- The school needs to be moved as they know that it is currently on a floodplain and building cannot take place on the existing site.
  - They were keen to have a 6<sup>th</sup> form, but felt that it would need to have a reasonable amount of options to be a success – the more choice, the better. They did not illustrate a preference between school 6<sup>th</sup> form provision or a 6<sup>th</sup> form college delivery.

- A number of children had gone to Baden Powell and St Albans primary schools but did not have any strong opinion of these schools moving or closing.
- They did not like the idea that the Tremorfa Park would be used for the build as it was parkland; the new location for accessing the school was not an issue, and there was no strong opinion that it would be difficult to get to.
- They felt that the pupils would greatly benefit with larger rooms and wider corridors to allow for 'active learning' and to move around the school more easily.
- IT facilities need to be improved greatly as current facilities are not good. They were aware that this is going to be very important in helping to gain future employment.
- They were concerned about any negative impact on the environment and wanted to know if there was an Eco-plan to actually produce something positive such as sustainable lighting. They felt this would be beneficial to the wellbeing of the pupils and the environment.

75. Notes of the meeting can be seen at Appendix 4.

### **St Alban's R.C. Primary School**

76. Officers met with members of the St Alban's R.C. Primary School Council to discuss the proposal and gather their opinions. Pupils gave clear feedback that they were all strongly against the proposal to close the school.

77. The pupils of St Alban's R.C. Primary School also wrote 80 letters of objection against the proposal to close the school. Feedback from the meeting with the school council can be seen at Appendix 4; details of the pupil letters can be seen at Appendix 8.

### **Baden Powell Primary School – Pupil representation**

78. Officers met with member of the Baden Powell Primary School, School Council to discuss the proposal and gather their opinions.

79. Pupils liked the idea of a new school building/facilities and the proposed establishment of sixth form.

80. The pupils were concerned that the new school may be too big, that there may be too many places if children from St Alban's RC Primary School choose not to attend Baden Powell Primary School, sharing a site with older children, the loss of nursery provision and the loss of parkland at Tremorfa Park.

81. Notes of the meeting can be seen at Appendix 4.

## **Pupil Surveys**

82. Online pupil surveys sought the views of pupils on the proposed changes, any changes or alternatives to the proposals, what pupils like and dislike about their current schools and what pupils would like to see in any new build school.
83. The pupils from Willows High School, Baden Powell Primary School and St Alban's Catholic Primary School who completed the survey supported the proposal to expand and move Willows High School and the proposal for post-16 provision.
84. There was overwhelming disagreement with the proposal to close St Alban's Catholic Primary School with 97.1% of those who completed the survey disagreeing with the proposal.
85. The proposal to expand and move Baden Powell Primary School was supported by a quarter of respondents with less than a third in favour of the proposal to remove nursery provision from the school. A third supported increasing the number of places at Tremorfa Nursery School.
86. The pupils would like to see additional services such as sports clubs, breakfast clubs and holiday clubs.
87. A number of children were concerned about the proposed closure of St Alban's Catholic Primary School
88. The pupils from Adamsdown Primary School, Moorland Primary School and Stacey Road Primary School who completed the survey supported the proposal to expand and move Willows High School and the proposal for post-16 provision.
89. Opinion of these pupils was split regarding the proposal to St Alban's Catholic Primary School with slightly more than half in favour of the proposal. More than half of these pupils (57.4%) supported the proposal to expand and move Baden Powell Primary School however the majority (78.7%) are against the removal of nursery provision from Baden Powell Primary School. The provision of additional places at Tremorfa Nursery School was supported by three quarters (75.3%) of these pupils.
90. The pupils would like to see additional services such as breakfast clubs, sports clubs, movie clubs, holiday clubs and extra curricula clubs provided.
91. A number of these children were concerned about the loss of parkland and the potential loss of friendships.
92. Details of the pupil surveys can be seen at Appendix 9.

## **Appraisal of views expressed**

93. The Council acknowledges the views of the pupils.

94. Issues related to the proposed closure of the school are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.
95. Pupils will be fully consulted with on revised proposals for early years, primary and secondary school provision to serve Adamsdown and Splott at the appropriate time.

### **Other responses received**

#### **Loss of parkland, natural habitat and children's play areas**

96. *The loss of parkland will be detrimental to the health and well-being of the communities of Splott and Tremorfa.*
97. *The proposal removes tremorfa park from the community at a time where outdoor sports are being encouraged to reduce childhood and adult obesity.*
98. *The environmental impact of Willows High School and Baden Powell Primary School relocating to Tremorfa Park has not been considered. The proposal would destroy a quiet nature filled green space that is home to many different species of wildlife including a bat colony.*
99. *For many the park provides the only trees, play parks and green space that they can access.*
100. *Tremorfa Park is home to mature trees which provide our city with clean, with grass pitches that allow children from the community to play sport as well as wildlife to feed and rest on, with space for families to play games and dog walker to exercise and a new park run to bring the community together through fitness.*
101. *The proposal would result in the loss of children's play areas.*

#### **Appraisal of views expressed**

102. The Council acknowledges the views expressed.
103. Issues related to the proposals consulted on are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.
104. An integral part of the proposal consulted on was the creation of a linear park extending from Tremorfa Park to the existing Willows High School site allowing for an area of commensurate value to be put into trust for use by the local community as public open space.

105. The points raised will be further appraised prior to bringing forward revised proposals for early years, primary and secondary school provision to serve Adamsdown and Splott.

### **Replacement Schools**

106. *The existing school is very dilapidated and that children in the area should be afforded a more structured curriculum within a safe a secure environment.*
107. *New facilities are long over due and much needed - pupils in the poorest parts of our city and nation need the best facilities in order to begin to compete in later life.*
108. *It is important that future pupils of the surrounding area and extended catchment area, are given every opportunity to reduce the inequality and poverty that they experience and live in. A new build would help reduce the differences with existing schools and areas whilst, improving the quality of facilities in the area. The improvements could help ensure the community improves its socio and economic status and rejuvenate the community. Thus, leading to improved social mobility and capital.*
109. *The need to provide improved facilities for school is recognised however the loss of parkland would be a retrograde step. Consideration should instead be given to providing for schools on their existing sites.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

110. The Council acknowledges the views expressed.
111. Issues related to the proposals consulted on are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16 and paragraph 102.
112. The points raised will be further appraised prior to bringing forward revised proposals for early years, primary and secondary school provision to serve Adamsdown and Splott.

### **Floodplain**

113. *Proposed flood defences would allow for building on the existing Willows High School site.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

114. The Council acknowledges the views expressed.
115. Issues related to the proposals consulted on are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.
116. The Willows High School site is within the flood zone and is therefore not viable to be developed for a school at this time. It is anticipated that, following construction of the proposed new costal defence wall, surveys would be

commissioned for the flood boundary to be reassessed by Natural Resources Wales.

117. Whilst the site could potentially be available to accommodate a replacement school building in future, proposals for new school buildings could not be brought forward until at least 2023. If new buildings were to be constructed on the existing school site, it is unlikely that pupils in Adamsdown and Splott would benefit from occupying these until 2026 or 2027.
118. The points raised will be further appraised prior to bringing forward revised proposals for early years, primary and secondary school provision to serve Adamsdown and Splott.

### **The colocation of schools**

119. The proposed colocation of schools is not a good idea with concerns around language, behaviour and safeguarding.

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

120. The Council acknowledges the views expressed.
121. Issues related to the proposals consulted on are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.
122. The points raised will be further appraised prior to bringing forward revised proposals for early years, primary and secondary school provision to serve Adamsdown and Splott.

### **Increased traffic**

123. *The proposed colocation of primary, secondary and sixth form provision will result in increased traffic congestion in the local area.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

124. The Council acknowledges the views expressed.
125. Issues related to the proposals consulted on are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.
126. The points raised will be further appraised prior to bringing forward revised proposals for early years, primary and secondary school provision to serve Adamsdown and Splott.

### **Impact on St Alban's Rugby Football Club (RFC)**

127. *St Alban's RFC has gone from a position of having to close the door to having a thriving mini and junior section and senior teams. The current plans could have a detrimental impact on the club's ability to maintain progress.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

128. The Council acknowledges the views expressed.
129. Issues related to the proposals consulted on are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.
130. Officers will continue to work with the Club and the points raised will be further appraised prior to bringing forward revised proposals for early years, primary and secondary school provision to serve Adamsdown and Splott.

### **Post-16 Provision**

131. *Pupils need encouragement to continue their education. Post-16 provision would provide more opportunities for young people, especially those from poorer backgrounds.*
132. *Post-16 provision can be sourced elsewhere.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

133. The Council acknowledges the views expressed.
134. Issues related to the proposals consulted on are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.
135. The Council is seeking to enable a greater number of learners to progress to education, employment or training when completing secondary education and is keen to support the development of opportunities between schools and businesses.
136. The points raised will be further appraised prior to bringing forward revised proposals for early years, primary and secondary school provision to serve Adamsdown and Splott.

### **St Alban's Catholic Primary School**

137. *Whilst investment in the area is very welcome, this should not be at the expense of St Alban's Catholic Primary School.*
138. *The closure of St Alban's Catholic Primary School would leave Splott and Tremorfa without a Catholic School.*

139. *Children will have to travel further for a Catholic education. The nearest Catholic school is in special measures.*
140. *Invest in St Alban's Catholic Primary School and work with the Archdiocese to ensure the future of the school and Catholic education in the local area.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

141. The Council acknowledges the views expressed.
142. Issues related to the proposed closure of the school are addressed at paragraphs 4 –16.
143. The points raised will be further appraised prior to bringing forward revised proposals for early years, primary and secondary school provision to serve Adamsdown and Splott.

### **Nursery Provision**

144. *Having nursery provision as part of Baden Powell Primary School helps with logistics and transition arrangements.*
145. *Removal of the nursery would allow for more focus on the primary school and dedicated nursery provision.*
146. *There are already a lack of nursery places for local children.*
147. *Tremorfa is an exemplary nursery and additional places would allow more families to benefit.*
148. *The expansion of Tremorfa Nursery should not be at the expense of Baden Powell Primary School.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

149. The Council acknowledges the views expressed.
150. Issues related to the proposals consulted on are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.
151. The points raised will be further appraised prior to bringing forward revised proposals for early years, primary and secondary school provision to serve Adamsdown and Splott.

### **Moorland Primary School**

152. *Moorland Primary School is also in need of investment and is being overlooked.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

- 153. The Council acknowledges the views expressed.
- 154. The point raised will be further appraised prior to bringing forward revised proposals for early years, primary and secondary school provision to serve Adamsdown and Splott.

### **Catchment area arrangements**

- 155. *What catchment changes will be made in Penylan to accommodate Howardian Primary in an area where there are not enough places for pupils.*
- 156. *The catchment area is very deprived and needs changing to enable a mix of pupils.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

- 157. There are no plans to change the Council's policy on the admission of children to schools as a result of this proposal. It is possible that catchment areas for English-medium community secondary schools may need to change as a result of changes proposed in the overall 21<sup>st</sup> Century Band B Schools Programme.
- 158. Changes to catchment areas would make sure there is a suitable balance in the supply of and take-up of places. Consultation would take place at an appropriate time to address this balance.

### **Additional Services**

- 159. *Affordable wraparound childcare and school holiday activities/clubs are needed.*
- 160. *Offering wraparound care may well encourage a great range of families to consider sending their children to the new provision.*
- 161. *This is an opportunity to improve sports facilities in the area and should be maximised.*
- 162. *More play areas are needed for different ages of children.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

- 163. The Council acknowledges the views expressed.
- 164. Issues related to the proposals consulted on are addressed at paragraphs 4 – 16.

165. The points raised will be further appraised prior to bringing forward revised proposals for early years, primary and secondary school provision to serve Adamsdown and Splott.